Canadian Food Studies



La Revue canadienne des études sur l'alimentation

Commentary

Strengthening democratic governance in times of crisis: Lessons from the Canadian Food Policy Advisory Council

Johanna Wilkes^{*a}, Charles Z. Levkoe^b, Peter Andrée^c, Jill K. Clark^d

Wilfrid Laurier University; ORCID: <u>0000-0003-1960-8553</u> Lakehead University; ORCID: <u>0000-0003-4950-2186</u> Carleton University; ORCID: <u>0000-0002-9814-9481</u> John Glenn College of Public Affairs; ORCID: <u>0000-0002-7415-3355</u>

Abstract

Democracy, including processes that govern food systems, are under threat of erosion. Contextualizing and articulating governance challenges is an essential first step. However, it is valuable to look to practices that provide more meaningful ways of engaging non-state actors in government processes. In this commentary, we look at the establishment and activities of the Canadian Food Policy Advisory Council (the Council) which has been "learning-by-doing" participatory governance. The Council offers insights into both the strengths and challenges that face participatory governance as well as highlights ways these processes can be strengthened. In such a critical time, it is important to strengthen mechanisms of engagement that both bolster meaningful engagement and accountability between the government and rights holders.

Keywords: Civil society; food system governance; participatory governance

*Corresponding author: wilk1423@mylaurier.ca Copyright © 2025 by the Author. Open access under CC-BY-SA license. DOI: <u>10.15353/cfs-rcea.v12i1.738</u> ISSN: 2292-3071 La démocratie, incluant les processus qui régissent les systèmes alimentaires, est menacée d'érosion. Contextualiser et articuler les défis de la gouvernance est une première étape essentielle. Toutefois, il est utile de se pencher sur les pratiques qui offrent des moyens plus significatifs d'impliquer les acteurs non étatiques dans les processus gouvernementaux. Dans ce commentaire, nous examinons la création et les activités du Conseil consultatif de la politique alimentaire du

Introduction

As we write this commentary in early 2025, democratic institutions across the globe are under increasing threat of erosion, from both authoritarian rule and corporate capture. While these realities have been growing over the past several decades, at this moment, there is a convergence of both phenomena happening at the same time and across scales. This was evident in the shift of global food governance at the United Nations during the 2021 Food Systems Summit that gave preference to corporate actors and eroded trust among civil society movements (Anderl & Hißen, 2024; Canfield et al., 2021) as well as the dismantling of democratic institutions and accountability watchdogs across the United States (Binkley & Megerian, 2025; Honderich, 2025). While these strategies to consolidate power are not new, this moment of convergence presents a real and present threat to current ways of life and collective well-being. In particular, these shifts undermine accountability measures between states and rights holders.

Canada qui a « appris par la pratique » la gouvernance participative. Le conseil offre un aperçu des forces de la gouvernance participative et des défis auxquels elle est confrontée, et met en lumière les moyens de renforcer ces processus. Dans une période aussi critique, il est important de renforcer les mécanismes d'engagement qui favorisent à la fois un engagement significatif et la responsabilité entre le gouvernement et les détenteurs de droits.

Contextualizing and articulating these challenges are an essential first step towards identifying alternative arrangements. However, it is possibly even more valuable to establish and enhance practices that provide meaningful ways of engaging non-state actors in government processes, especially those most impacted and often marginalized by decisions. This includes opportunities for participatory governance, that is, relational approaches, grounded in principles of deliberative democracy and collaboration that involve diverse voices and perspectives in decision making processes. Our research on civil society and social movement engagement in food systems governance across Canada and Indigenous territories has explored opportunities and cautions related to these efforts (for example, Levkoe et al., 2023, 2025; Littlefield et al., 2024; Guinto et al., 2024; Wilson & Tasala, 2024). In this commentary, we look at the establishment and activities of the Canadian Food Policy Advisory Council¹ which has been "learning-by-doing" participatory governance.²

¹ Hereafter referred to as "the Council."

² For a review of our research findings see Wilkes et al., 2025.

Identifying approaches to food systems governance that involve a broader range of engagement can help to develop solutions to persistent and emerging issues. Drawing on diverse experiences and perspectives within food systems can contribute to more informed decision-making. Likewise, participatory mechanisms for governance can ensure greater accountability to the public (and specifically for food producers, harvesters, workers across the food chain, and Indigenous people). Food policy groups are key examples of participatory food governance efforts, established with the explicit goal of engaging a wide range of sectors and people in decision making across food systems (Schiff et al., 2022; Bassarab et al., 2019). With the growth in food policy groups,³ in tandem with food systems scholarship and civil society advocacy, more integrated approaches to food policy have received greater attention.

Building on efforts like the People's Food Commission (1980) and the People's Food Policy (Food Secure Canada [FSC], 2011), the Food Policy for Canada was established by the federal government in 2019. It was informed by the work of researchers, civil society, and industry advocacy from across Canada and Indigenous territories (ad hoc Working Group on Food Policy Governance, 2017). As participatory governance that involves active civil society engagement gained traction (Martorell & Andrée, 2018), consultation on the Food Policy for Canada built expectations around the possibilities of more inclusive food systems governance processes (Levkoe & Wilson, 2019). In 2021, the federal government announced the Council tasked with supporting and helping to guide the Minister of Agriculture and Agri-Food Canada (AAFC) on issues relevant to the Food Policy, including its direction and implementation. Functioning as a national food policy group, the

Council was launched "as a framework to align and coordinate federal food-related initiatives and address critical challenges facing Canada's food systems to improve social, health, environmental and economic outcomes" (Government of Canada, 2025, para 1). Members were selected to represent a wide range of regions, communities, industries, and interests.

The Council's establishment was a significant step towards more participatory food systems governance in Canada. Our research findings showed it has provided a space for civil society actors to engage with the government and offers key recommendations on issues such as food waste, agricultural sustainability, food insecurity, and the design of a national school food program. The Council fostered relationships with AAFC staff and enabled collaborative efforts among its members. Our findings also revealed that Council members were deeply committed to the process and brought significant expertise and experience to the table. However, the structure and function of the Council were not flawless. We found challenges of representation, such as members being unevenly resourced, a lack of transparency in agenda setting and evaluation mechanisms, and barriers for members to engage or consult with wider audiences. Unfortunately, it is unclear how or if the Council will move forward. At the time of writing, the Council has not met since 2023, and no new appointments have been announced. Despite its challenges, the Council offers a useful mechanism for more participatory food governance in Canada, one that should be further strengthened by the government and supported by civil society organizations (albeit critically and carefully).

In these uncertain times, rather than a global governance deficit, as the Secretary of the United Nations has stated, (United Nations, 2024) we see a

³ The Food Communities Network (n.d.) and the John Hopkins Centre for a Livable Future (n.d.) have documented the evolution and different iterations (e.g. structure, scope, relation to government, scale) of food policy groups over time.

deficit of democracy. Lessons learned from the inaugural Council provide a window into how to strengthen participatory governance and democratic engagement. Amid a shift towards more authoritarian rule and corporate capture, we hope the Council (and our research) offers lessons on how to meaningfully engage with knowledgeable and experienced actors while remaining accountable to producers, harvesters, Indigenous people, workers, and eaters across food systems.

Acknowledgements: We would like to thank both the Secretariat and the inaugural Council members who participated in this process for their time and valuable insights. We hope that your contributions are able to highlight the learnings for participatory food governance processes, both in Canada and beyond. We would also like to the thank the entire Participatory Food Governance team, who have offered invaluable feedback and contributions along the way. This work would not be possible without the financial support of the Province of Ontario and the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council.

Johanna Wilkes (she/her) is a Ph.D. Candidate at the Balsillie School of International Affairs and a Research Assistant at Lakehead University as part of the Sustainable Food Systems Lab. Interested in questions of international governance, public policy, and food systems, Johanna explores how national and international institutions tackle issues surrounding climate-resilient farming and sustainable futures. Johanna is of settler ancestry who lives and works as an uninvited guest on the traditional territory of <u>the Anishnawbe, Haudenosaunee and Neutral peoples</u>.

Charles Z. Levkoe is the Canada Research Chair in Equitable and Sustainable Food Systems, a Member of the College of New Scholars, Artists and Scientists of the Royal Society of Canada, and a Professor in the Department of Health Sciences at Lakehead University. His community engaged research uses a food systems lens to explore connections between social justice, ecological regeneration, regional economies and democratic engagement. <u>https://foodsystems.lakeheadu.ca/</u>

Peter Andrée is Professor in the Department of Political Science at Carleton University. He is the Director of the Carleton Center for Community Innovation (3ci), a university-wide research centre that seeks to strengthen community vitality in Canada and abroad by linking community-engaged research to policy and practice. He is also co-director, with Dr. John Reid of the Ngai Tahu Centre at the University of Canterbury, of the "Living Relation" partnership. This partnership shares stories of decolonizing food system sustainability transition initiatives in Aotearoa New Zealand and Canada.

Jill Clark is a professor at the John Glenn College of Public Affairs, Ohio State University. Clark's research focus is agrifood system policy and planning, centering on community and state governance of food systems and public engagement. Clark provides statewide leadership as a steering committee member of the Ohio Food Policy Network, international leadership as the past-president of the Agriculture, Food, and Human Values Society, and local leadership as an appointment member of the city and county local food board. Clark recently was awarded the 2022 Excellence in Engaged Scholarship from the Engaged Scholarship Consortium.

References

Anderl, F., & Hißen, M. (2024). How trust is lost: The Food Systems Summit 2021 and the delegitimation of UN food governance. *European Journal of International Relations*, *30*(1), 151-175. https://doi.org/10.1177/13540661231173553

Andrée, Peter; Ballamingie, Patricia; Bancerz, Margaret; Bilyea, Ted; Bronson, Diana; Buckingham, Don; et al. (2023). The Case for A National Food Policy Council. Toronto Metropolitan University. Report. https://doi.org/10.32920/24084801.v1

Bassarab, K., Clark, J., Santo, R., & Palmer, A. (2019). Finding our way to food democracy: Lessons from US food policy council governance. *Politics and Governance*, 7(4), 32-47. https://doi.org/10.17645/pag.v7i4.2092

Binkley, C., & Megerian, C. (2025). *Trump orders a plan to dismantle the education department while keeping some core*

functions. AP News. https://apnews.com/article/trumpeducation-department-shutdownb1d25a2e1bdcd24cfde8ad8b655b9843

Canfield, M., Anderson, M. D., & McMichael, P. (2021). UN food systems summit 2021: Dismantling democracy and resetting corporate control of food systems. *Frontiers in Sustainable Food Systems*, *5*, 661552. https://doi.org/10.3389/fsufs.2021.661552

Food Communities Network. (n.d.). *Food policy groups directory*. https://fcn-rcn.ca/food-policy-groups-directory/

Food Secure Canada (FSC). (2011). Resetting the table: A people's food policy for Canada. https://foodsecurecanada.org/wordpress/wpcontent/uploads/2023/06/2015-FSC-22Resetting-the-Table-A-peoples-food-policy22.pdf

Government of Canada. (2025). *The Food Policy for Canada*. Agriculture and Agri-Food Canada. https://agriculture.canada.ca/en/department/initiatives/foo d-policy-canada

Guinto, R., Holley, K., Pictou, S., Tinirau, R., Wiremu, F., Andreé, P., Clark, J., Levkoe, C. Z., & Reeve, B. (2024). Challenging power relations in food systems governance: A conversation about moving from inclusion to decolonization. *Journal of Agriculture, Food Systems, and Community Development, 13*(2), 91–108. https://doi.org/10.5304/jafscd.2024.132.009

Honderich, H. (2025). *Trump fires at least a dozen* government watchdogs. BBC News. https://www.bbc.com/news/articles/c5yveml59jlo.

Johns Hopkins. (n.d.). *Food policy networks.* https://www.foodpolicynetworks.org/

Levkoe, C. Z., & Wilson, A. (2019). Policy engagement as prefiguration: Experiments in food policy governance through the national food policy dialogue in Canada. In P. Andrée, J. K. Clark, C. Z. Levkoe, & K. Lowitt (Eds.), *Civil society and social movements in food system governance* (pp. 101-123). Routledge.

Levkoe, C. Z., Andrée, P., Ballamingie, P., Tasala, K., Wilson, A., & Korzun, M. (2023). Civil society engagement in food systems governance in Canada: Experiences, gaps, and possibilities. *Journal of Agriculture, Food Systems, and Community Development, 12*(2), 267–286. https://doi.org/10.5304/jafscd.2023.122.005 Levkoe, C. Z., Wilkes, J., & Andrée, P. (2025). Advancing food systems governance: Perspective of civil society organizations. *Journal of Civil Society*, *21*(1), 83-102. https://doi.org/10.1080/17448689.2024.2437578

Littlefield, C., Stollmeyer, M., Andrée, P., Ballamingie, P., & Levkoe, C. Z. (2024). Exploring settler-Indigenous engagement in food systems governance. *Agriculture and Human Values*, *41*(3), 1085-1101. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10460-023-10534-3

Martorell, H., & Andrée, P. (2018). The commoning of food governance in Canada: Pathways towards a national food policy? In J. L. Vivero-Pol, T. Ferrando, O. De Schutter and U. Mattei (Eds.), *Routledge Handbook of Food as a Commons* (pp. 266-280). Routledge.

People's Food Commission. (1980). *The land of milk and money: The national report of the People's Food Commission*. https://foodsecurecanada.org/wordpress/wp-content/uploads/2023/06/1980-The-Peoples-Food-Commission-22Land_of_Milk_and_Money22.pdf

Schiff, R., Levkoe, C. Z., & Wilkinson, A. (2022). Food policy councils: A 20-year scoping review (1999–2019). *Frontiers in Sustainable Food Systems*, 6, 868995. https://doi.org/10.3389/fsufs.2022.868995

United Nations. (2024, November 18). Secretary-General's remarks to session on reform of global governance institutions.

https://www.un.org/sg/en/content/sg/statement/2024-11-18/secretary-generals-remarks-g20-session-reform-of-globalgovernance-institutions-

delivered#:~:text=18%20November%202024-

,Secretary%2DGeneral's%20remarks%20to%20G20%20Sessio n%20on%20Reform%20of%20Global,boards%20of%20globa l%20financial%20institutions

Wilkes, J. Levkoe, C. Z., Andrée, P., & Clark, J. (2025). Understanding food systems governance in a changing world: The Canadian Food Policy Advisory Council. Report. https://foodsystems.lakeheadu.ca/participatory-foodgovernance/

Wilson, A., & Tasala, K. (2024). Moving beyond awareness to action and food system transformation: Prioritizing labor in food systems governance work. *Frontiers in Sustainable Food Systems*, *8*, 1321297.

https://doi.org/10.3389/fsufs.2024.1321297